



Available Online through

www.ijptonline.com

THE EFFECT OF PARTICIPATORY MANAGEMENT ON NURSE JOB SATISFACTION

Hosien Shahdadi*¹, Roghaiyeh AfsarGharebagh², JasimAllahyari³, Abbas Balouchi³, Esmat Bandani⁴

¹Lecturer, Department of Nursing, School of Nursing and Midwifery, Zabol University of Medical Sciences, Zabol, Iran.

²Assistant professor of cardiology, Department of cardiology, Uremia University of Medical Science, Uremia, Iran.

³Student, Student Research Committee, Faculty of Nursing and Midwifery, Zabol University of Medical Sciences, Zabol, Iran.

⁴BSc of Nursing, School of Nursing and Midwifery, Zabol University of Medical Sciences, Zabol, Iran.

Email: Zb5950@gmail.com

Received on 06-08-2016

Accepted on 10-09-2016

Abstract

Introduction: While coping with the future challenges for achieving high productivity, organizations have no choice but to win the trust and commitment of their staff. This is possible by job satisfaction. Participatory management is one of effective factors in job satisfaction.

Method: This is a quasi-experimental study performed among nurses before and after the intervention in order to evaluate the effect of participatory management on job satisfaction of nurses working in CCU of a hospital in Zabol, Iran in 2013. The statistical population consisted of all nurses working in CCU. Data were collected using two questionnaires namely Demographic Questionnaire and Job Satisfaction Questionnaire designed according to Frederick Herzberg's Two-Factor Theory. The latter has 34 items of which 17 are related to the sanitary factors and 17 are related to the motivational factors. Job satisfaction of nurses was first assessed before the intervention. Participatory management was then performed according to the quality control circles. SPSS was employed to analyze the data.

Results: The results showed that the mean scores of nurse job satisfaction (total sum of sanitary and motivational factors) increased from 88.71% to 97.35%.

Conclusion: The results showed that applying participatory management increases the nurse job satisfaction. It is recommended that policy makers increase the motivational programs in order to increase the participation of nurses.

Keywords: Nurse, Participatory Management, Job Satisfaction.

Introduction: Job satisfaction has always been a matter in organizations as it is claimed to be one of important subjects in maintaining the exploratory resources of organizations (1). Lack of attention to the job satisfaction

disrupts the organization's social system in the long-run, leading to rebellion, loss of sense of responsibility and eventually turnover(2). Studies show that job satisfaction has a relationship with turnover intention, The correlation ranges between -0.42 and -0.25(3). Nurse job satisfaction is of great importance because nursing is one of key and important professions in societies (4). Golchin (1993) studied the nurse job satisfaction and factors affecting it, He concluded that 65.2% of the subjects were dissatisfied with their jobs. The most adverse effect of job dissatisfaction is turnover [quitting job](5, 6). Gillis estimated the nurse turnover to be between 60% and 70%(7). Experimental studies also show a negative relationship between the absence of nurses and job satisfaction as increasing the job satisfaction effectively reduced the absence (8). According to the 1991 Iran's Census, the total male and female populations were 28768450 and 27068713, respectively Total number of nurses was 9534 in 1991, meaning that there was one nurse for every 5856 people. This number is 4-6 nurses for each 1000 people in developed countries(9). Therefore, Iran is facing lack on nurses. Studies show that the turnover intention is highlighted in nursing profession compared to other jobs(10). The contradiction between the efforts made by nurses in providing high-quality care and dealing with the environmental stress causes a syndrome called burnout syndrome followed by the emotional exhaustion, lack of motivation, apathy and loss of interest in work environment(11). Creating environments for development and dynamism of the individuals and challenging job so that the knowledge and skills increase is a key factor to increase the motivation and accordingly, job satisfaction (12). According to the studies, changing managers causes job satisfaction, indicating the fact that nurse supervisors and managers are determinants of job satisfaction(13). The results of the study by Navidian(2005) showed that nurses do not generally have high job satisfaction and most of them (80.9%) believed that their managers' performance was weak (14). A study entitled "The Comments of Nurses in Nurse Manager Decision-Making Process in Yazd Medical Universities, Iran (1993)" showed that most subjects (53.19%) stated that they were not involved in their own affairs including planning, work division, performance evaluation, and the provision of facilities. Therefore, they were dissatisfied with the management system of nurse supervisors and hospital(15, 16). J Bowers et al. (2015) stated that job satisfaction and motivation increase is among the factors affecting the progress of nursing profession through the appropriate management and leadership practices (17). Creative nurse managers can minimize the negative effects of hierarchy and bureaucracy in their management domain by involving the staff in decision-making process and evaluation. Authoritarian practices have a negative impact on nurses in the long term, resulting in nurse disobedience, aggression, and personality damage. In authoritarian practices, which are common in Iranian hospitals, nurses gradually lose their

independence (18, 19). This article aims to study the effect of participatory management practices according to the formation of quality circles and their consequences on nurse job satisfaction.

Method

Design and Participants

This is a quasi-experimental study performed among nurses before and after the intervention in order to evaluate the effect of participatory management on job satisfaction of nurses working in CCU of a hospital in Zabol, Iran in 2013. The sample size consisted of all nurses working in CCU.

Data Collection

The non-random, convenience sampling method was employed and all nurses were enrolled as the sample. Data were collected using two questionnaires namely Demographic Questionnaire and Job Satisfaction Questionnaire.

Demographic Questionnaire: This questionnaire is used to collect some data including age, marital status, work experience, number of children, working shifts, employment status, current job position, income, and work experience in CCU ward. **Job Satisfaction Questionnaire:** It was employed to determine the nurse job satisfaction

designed according to Frederick Herzberg's Two-Factor Theory(20). It has 34 items of which 17 are related to the sanitary factors and 17 are related to the motivational factors. Items are scored on a four-point Likert rating scale with 4=Very Satisfied, 3= Satisfied, 2=Dissatisfied, and 1=No Idea. Both questionnaires were forwarded to the subjects in

order to determine the nurse job satisfaction. As a result, nurse job satisfaction was evaluated before the intervention.

Then, the researcher hold two briefing sessions for the matron and educational supervisor, two briefing sessions for the ward supervisor, and one briefing session for each of the supervisors of evening and night shifts concerning the participatory management approach, its advantages, and some explanations regarding the logic behind the formation

of quality circles, how to form them, and the objectives of them. Next, four circles (morning, afternoon, and two night shifts) were formed. Nurses were divided into two groups in each shift in order to hold the training sessions (Group A and Group B). A total of six training sessions were considered for each group. Three training sessions, however, were

hold due to lack of personnel, workload (12 CCU beds), and the unique feature of CCU ward. In order to form the quality circles, the members discussed the problems and solutions according to appropriate schedule once or twice a week when needed. At the end of the intervention, Job Satisfaction Questionnaire was again forwarded to the nurses

and job satisfaction was re-evaluated. Job satisfaction was statistically compared prior to and after the intervention.

Content validity was employed to verify the validity. To this end, a total of 10 esteemed professors working in Tabiat

Modarres, Tehran, Iran, and Shahid Beheshti universities evaluated the questionnaire. Their comments were taken into account to modify the questionnaire. Retest method was used to verify the reliability. To this end, Job Satisfaction Questionnaire was forwarded to 10 nurses. The questionnaire was forwarded once again to the same nurses after a week. The reliability was verified at 0.006 significance level and confidence level of 0.87 after eliminating one case.

Data Analysis

Descriptive statistics were used for demographic variables including the relative and absolute frequency and mean. Chi-square test was employed to find the relationship between them. The data were analyzed using SPSS.

Results

Demographic Characteristics

A total of 17 nurses participated in the study. Findings show that most nurses are female (94.11%), older than 30 (47.76%), married (94.52%), and officially employed (94.11%) and have more than 11 years of work experience (47.76%), no children (52.94%), evening and night shift (82.58%), 160000-200000 Rials income (70.58%), and nurse position (47.76%). Most nurses do not work overtime (35.82%), have 1-5 years of working experience in CCU ward (58.82%), have not worked in other wards (47.76%), and passed CCU course (23.88%).

The Effect of Participatory Management on Nurse Job Satisfaction

According to table1 the mean scores of sanitary factors were 32 and 43.23 before and after the intervention, respectively. Therefore, the score increased by 35.09% for sanitary factors.

Table 1: Comparison mean and SD of sanitary factors before and after of intervention.

Time \ Result	Mean	SD
Before	32	9.4
After	43.23	3.63

According to table 2, the mean scores of motivational factors were 39.88 and 54.11 before and after the intervention, respectively. As it can be seen, the mean score of motivational factors increased by 35.68%.

Table 2: Comparison mean and SD of motivational factors before and after of intervention.

Time \ Result	Mean	SD
Before	39.88	9.67
After	54.11	7.68

According to table 3, the mean scores of job satisfaction were 71.88 and 97.35 before and after the intervention, respectively. Therefore, the mean score of motivational factors increased by 35.43%.

Table 3: Comparison mean and SD of job satisfaction before and after of intervention.

Time	Result	Mean	SD
Before		71.88	17
After		97.35	10.19

Discussion

In this article, we studied the effect of participatory management on job satisfaction of nurses working in CCU ward in one hospital in Zabol, Iran in 2013. Findings were analyzed using descriptive statistical methods. The mean scores of sanitary factors increased from 32 to 43.23 which is consistent with the results of the study by Ehsani (2013) entitled "The Relationship between Leadership Style of Nurse Supervisors and Job Satisfaction of Nurses Working in Internal and Surgical Wards in tonekabon". Findings show that external satisfaction of nurses in internal ward ($P<0.001$) and surgical ward ($P<0.0001$) and total of internal and surgical wards ($P<0.0001$) have a significant relationship with leadership style of nurse supervisors (21). The mean score of motivational factors increased from 39.88 to 54.11. Heroabadi (1996) stated that educated classes who have higher social and cultural levels mainly seek dignity, respect, and self-discovery. In other words, they regard the internal motivational factors (22). This is consistent with the study by Morrison RS al (1997) that showed that internal satisfaction of nurses working in the Alabama Regional Medical Centers has a significant relationship with leadership style of nurses (23) A study by Khodayarian (2011), who studied the relationship between the leadership style of nurses and nurse job satisfaction, concluded that the leadership style of most of nurses is authoritarian and a high percentage of nurses working in internal and surgical wards displayed low satisfaction and job satisfaction. Leadership style of nurse supervisors had a statistically significant relationship with internal satisfaction of nurses ($P<0.02$) and nurse job satisfaction ($P<0.001$) (24). Nurses' participation in their own affairs is also an ethical matter because it brings about the mental health and, as a result, is effective in interest in the work and development of self-esteem(25). Fuller and Morison (1977) studied the relationship between the leadership style and empowerment and its effect on nurse job satisfaction. The results showed that leadership styles of managers and their capabilities in empowering the nurses have a significant relationship with nurse job satisfaction. Therefore, they proposed to design a model in order to implement the effective leadership style related to the nursing personnel empowerment. They also predicted that this intervention

can cause the growth and prosperity in nurses and be used as an effective strategy in increasing nurse job satisfaction

(23). The means scores of job satisfaction increased from 71.88 to 97.35 which is consistent with the results of the study by Lee Chan Lee et al. (1997) entitled "A Quasi-experimental study According to Quality Circles in Taiwanese Hospitals". The article aimed to study the effect of quality circles on job satisfaction and absence and turnover of nurses in Taiwanese hospitals. The results showed that the formation of quality circles ($P < 0.01$) causes an increase in job satisfaction and decline in absence and turnover by 40% (26). Huy, Mary and Caroline (2002) studied the effect of transformational leadership styles of managers working in faculty of nursing on job satisfaction of Taiwanese nursing trainers. They concluded that the leadership styles of managers in nursing faculty have a statistically significant relationship with the trainer job satisfaction ($P < 0.001$) (27). Manolovich and Locander (2002) studied the relationship between the empowerment and personality traits and its effect on nurse job satisfaction. They concluded that the psychological empowerment causes nurse job satisfaction increase. The Control Theory was employed for the theoretical frame of the study. Control Theory states that if the personnel are supported by the managers and involved in decision making, their independence increases, their efficiency rises, and eventually they have higher job satisfaction (28). According to table 5, the mean scores of sanitary factors increased from 32 to 43.23. The mean scores of motivational factors increased from 39.88 to 54.11. The means cores of job satisfaction increased from 71.88 to 97.35. Therefore, the mean scores of sanitary factors, motivational factors, and job satisfaction increased by 35.09%, 35.68%, and 35.43%, respectively. Lucas (1991) studied the opinions of nurses concerning the current management practices and the relationship between the management practices and job satisfaction of nurses. He showed that job satisfaction has a significant relationship with management style ($P < 0.001$). Age, nursing work experience, education, working shift, marital status, and type of hospital have no significant relationship with job satisfaction (28).

Limitations: The most important limitations in our study were the emotional exhaustion caused by work overload, lack of personnel, and high stress in CCU ward.

Conclusion: The results indicate an increase in job satisfaction after implementing the participatory management according to the formation of quality circles, showing the importance of participatory management by policy makers in health system.

References”

1. Oliver RL. Satisfaction: A behavioral perspective on the consumer: Routledge; 2014.

2. Azanza G, Moriano JA, Molero F. Authentic leadership and organizational culture as drivers of employees' job satisfaction. *Revista de Psicología del Trabajo y de las Organizaciones*. 2013;29(2):45-50.
3. Yücel İ. Examining the relationships among job satisfaction, organizational commitment, and turnover intention: An empirical study. *International Journal of Business and Management*. 2012;7(20):44.
4. Jang J, George RT. Understanding the influence of polychronicity on job satisfaction and turnover intention: A study of non-supervisory hotel employees. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*. 2012;31(2):588-95.
5. Borda RG, Norman IJ. Factors influencing turnover and absence of nurses: a research review. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*. 1997;34(6):385-94.
6. Kiani F, Rahnama M, Dadkani E, Balouchi A, Fazeli K. A Comparison of Hospital Stressors and their Related Factors: From the Perspective of the Cardiac and Internal Wards' Patients. *International Journal of Pharmaceutical and Clinical Research*. 2016;8(1):80-5.
7. Whall AL, Gillis GL, Yankou D, Booth DE, Beel-Bates CA. Disruptive behavior in elderly nursing home residents: A survey of nursing staff. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing*. 1992;18(10):13-7.
8. Abbaschian R, Avazeh A, Rabi Siahkali S. Job Satisfaction and its Related Factors among Nurses in the Public Hospitals of Zanjan University of Medical Sciences, 2010. *Preventive Care In Nursing & Midwifery Journal*. 2011;1(1):17-24.
9. Aghajanian A. Population Change In Iran, 1966-86: a stalled demographic transition? *Population and Development Review*. 1991:703-15.
10. Farsi Z, DEGHAN-NAYERI N, Negarandeh R, Broomand S. Nursing profession in Iran: an overview of opportunities and challenges. *Japan Journal of Nursing Science*. 2010;7(1):9-18.
11. Aiken LH, Clarke SP, Sloane DM, Sochalski JA, Busse R, Clarke H, et al. Nurses' reports on hospital care in five countries. *Health affairs*. 2001;20(3):43-53.
12. Aiken LH, Clarke SP, Sloane DM, Sochalski J, Silber JH. Hospital nurse staffing and patient mortality, nurse burnout, and job dissatisfaction. *Jama*. 2002;288(16):1987-93.
13. Aiken LH, Clarke SP, Sloane DM, Lake ET, Cheney T. Effects of hospital care environment on patient mortality and nurse outcomes. *The Journal of nursing administration*. 2008;38(5):223.
14. Salehi S, Zarshenas L, Eslamiyan J, Rastegari M. Identification of Nursing Management Planning Standards in Iran. *Iranian Journal of Nursing and Midwifery Research*. 2008;12(3).

15. Navidian A, Masoudi G, Mousavi S. Work-related Stress and the General Health of Nursing Staffs in Zahedans' Hospitals Emergency Wards (2004). *Journal of Kermanshah University of Medical Sciences (J Kermanshah Univ Med Sci)*. 2005;9(3).
16. Darban F, Balouchi A, Narouipour A, Safarzaei E, Shahdadi H. Effect of Communication Skills Training on the Burnout of Nurses: A Cross-Sectional Study. *Journal of clinical and diagnostic research: JCDR*. 2016;10(4):IC01.
17. Bowers J, Cheyne H, Mould G, Page M. Continuity of care in community midwifery. *Health care management science*. 2015;18(2):195-204.
18. Joyner K, Shefer T, Smit E. Discourses and practices in institutionalised nursing in South Africa: challenges for care. *South African review of Sociology*. 2014;45(3):34-52.
19. Ghanbarzehi N, Balouchi A, Sabzvari S, Darban F, Khayat NH. Effect of Triage Training on Concordance of Triage Level between Triage Nurses and Emergency Medical Technicians. 2016.
20. Weiss DJ, Dawis RV, England GW. *Manual for the Minnesota Satisfaction Questionnaire*. Minnesota studies in vocational rehabilitation. 1967.
21. Ehsani M, Sedaghati M, Ghanbari A. Evaluation of the relationship of head nurses' leadership style to nurses' job satisfaction working in medical-surgical wards of hospitals affiliated to Tonekabon Islamic Azad University, Iran. *Education & Ethics In Nursing*. 2013;1(1):14-20.
22. Heroabadi S, Marbaghi A. Management of nursing and midwifery. *Iran University of Medical sciences*. 1996:35-56.
23. Morrison RS, Jones L, Fuller B. The relation between leadership style and empowerment on job satisfaction of nurses. *Journal of Nursing Administration*. 1997;27(5):27-34.
24. Khodayarian M, Vanaki Z, Navipour H, Vaezi AA. The effect of nursing management development program on clinical competency in coronary care unit. *Journal of Kermanshah University of Medical Sciences (J Kermanshah Univ Med Sci)*. 2011;15(1).
25. Swansburg RC, Swansburg RJ. *Introduction to management and leadership for nurse managers: Jones & Bartlett Learning*; 2002.
26. Lee L-c, Yang K-P, Chen T-Y. A quasi-experimental study on a quality circle program in a Taiwanese hospital. *International Journal for Quality in Health Care*. 2000;12(5):413-8.

27. Shieh HL, Mills ME, Waltz CF. Academic leadership style predictors for nursing faculty job satisfaction in Taiwan. *Journal of Nursing Education*. 2001;40(5):203-9.
28. Manojlovich M, Laschinger HKS. The relationship of empowerment and selected personality characteristics to nursing job satisfaction. *Journal of Nursing Administration*. 2002;32(11):586-95.

Corresponding Author:

Hosien Shahdadi,

Lecturer, Department of Nursing, School of Nursing and Midwifery,

Zabol University of Medical Sciences, Zabol, Iran.

Email: Zb5950@gmail.com